

1 CHAD A. READLER  
Acting Assistant Attorney General  
2 SCOTT G. STEWART  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
3 WILLIAM C. PEACHEY  
Director

4 Office of Immigration Litigation  
U.S. Department of Justice  
5 WILLIAM C. SILVIS  
Assistant Director

6 Office of Immigration Litigation  
7 SARAH B. FABIAN  
Senior Litigation Counsel

8 NICOLE MURLEY  
Trial Attorney

9 Office of Immigration Litigation  
10 U.S. Department of Justice  
11 Box 868, Ben Franklin Station  
12 Washington, DC 20442  
13 Telephone: (202) 532-4824  
14 Fax: (202) 616-8962

15  
16 ADAM L. BRAVERMAN  
United States Attorney  
17 SAMUEL W. BETTWY  
Assistant U.S. Attorney  
18 California Bar No. 94918  
19 Office of the U.S. Attorney  
20 880 Front Street, Room 6293  
21 San Diego, CA 92101-8893  
22 619-546-7125  
619-546-7751 (fax)

23 *Attorneys for Federal Respondents-*  
24 *Defendants*

Lee Gelernt\*  
Judy Rabinovitz\*  
Anand Balakrishnan\*  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION  
125 Broad St., 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
T: (212) 549-2660  
F: (212) 549-2654  
*lgelernt@aclu.org*  
*jrabinovitz@aclu.org*  
*abalakrishnan@aclu.org*

Bardis Vakili (SBN 247783)  
ACLU FOUNDATION OF SAN  
DIEGO & IMPERIAL COUNTIES  
P.O. Box 87131  
San Diego, CA 92138-7131  
T: (619) 398-4485  
F: (619) 232-0036  
*bvakili@aclusandiego.org*

Stephen B. Kang (SBN 292280)  
Spencer E. Amdur (SBN 320069)  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
T: (415) 343-1198  
F: (415) 395-0950  
*skang@aclu.org*  
*samdur@aclu.org*

*Attorneys for Petitioners-Plaintiffs*  
*\*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

3 MS. L, et al.,

Case No. 18cv428 DMS MDD

4 Petitioners-Plaintiffs,

**JOINT STATUS REPORT  
REGARDING REUNIFICATION**

5 vs.

6 U.S. IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS  
7 ENFORCEMENT, et al.,

8 Respondents-Defendants.

9  
10 On July 9, 2018, this Court held a status conference, and ordered the parties  
11 to file a joint report on July 10, 2018, “setting forth how many Class Members  
12 have been or will be reunited with their children by the court-imposed deadline,  
13 and how many Class Members may not be reunited with their children by the  
14 court-imposed deadline due to legitimate logistical impediments that render timely  
15 compliance impossible or excusable . . . .” ECF No. 95 at 2. The parties submit this  
16 joint status report in accordance with the Court’s instruction.  
17  
18  
19

20 **I. COMPLIANCE**

21 **A. Defendants’ Position**

22 As previously reported to the Court, Defendants have identified 102 children  
23 under age 5 who, upon initial review by the U.S. Department of Health and Human  
24 Services (“HHS”) were determined potentially to have been separated from a  
25 parent, and who therefore were potentially the children of class members. Upon  
26  
27  
28

1 further review, and based on the latest available information at the time of filing,  
 2 Defendants report the following regarding the reunification scenarios for those 102  
 3 children.  
 4

5 *Not Eligible For Reunification*

- 6 • 14 are not eligible for reunification because their parents are not class  
 7 members.
  - 8 ○ 8 parents had serious criminal history discovered during  
 9 background checks (criminal histories identified include child  
 10 cruelty and narcotics, human smuggling, a warrant for murder,  
 11 and robbery).
  - 12 ○ 5 adults were determined not to be the parent of the  
 13 accompanying child.
  - 14 ○ 1 parent faces credible evidence of child abuse.
- 15 • 2 are not eligible for reunification because their parents are not class  
 16 members at this time.
  - 17 ○ 1 parent has been determined to present a danger to the child at  
 18 this time because an adult in the household where the parent  
 19 plans to live with the child has an outstanding warrant for  
 20 aggravated criminal sexual abuse against a 10 year old girl.  
 21 This determination can be reconsidered if the parent identifies a  
 22 different living situation.
  - 23 ○ 1 parent detained in ICE custody is currently being treated for a  
 24 communicable disease. When the parent no longer has a  
 25 communicable disease, the reunification process can proceed.
- 26 • 10 are not eligible for reunification at this time. They will be assessed  
 27 for reunification after they are released from criminal custody,  
 28 provided that Defendants are made aware of that release.
  - 8 parents are in the custody of U.S. Marshals Service. They will  
 be assessed for reunification after they are released from  
 criminal custody and are transferred to U.S. Immigration and  
 Customs Enforcement (“ICE”) custody.
  - 2 additional parents are in state or county custody. They will be  
 assessed for reunification after they are released from criminal

1 custody, provided that Defendants are made aware of that  
2 release.

- 3 • 1 child cannot be reunified at this time because the parent's location  
4 has been unknown for more than a year. Defendants are unable to  
5 conclusively determine whether the parent is a class member, and  
6 records show the parent and child might be U.S. citizens.

7 Likely Eligible For Reunification

- 8 • 4 children were reunified with family members before the July 10  
9 deadline.  
10 ○ 1 was released to a parent that ICE released into the U.S.  
11 ○ 1 was released to a parent in the U.S. with the other parent  
12 being deported.  
13 ○ 1 was released to a parent in the U.S. with the other parent  
14 being still in ICE custody  
15 ○ 1 voluntarily departed with the child's adult sibling, with the  
16 consent of the parent who is still in ICE custody.
- 17 • 51 are eligible for reunification with a parent who is currently in ICE  
18 detention.  
19 ○ 34 parents have cleared a criminal background check and  
20 parentage has been verified through a positive DNA match.  
21 They are expected to be reunified on July 10, 2018.  
22 ○ 16 parents have cleared a criminal background check but the  
23 process for verifying parentage has not yet been completed.  
24 They are expected to be reunified on July 10, 2018, or as soon  
25 thereafter as parentage can be verified.  
26 ○ 1 parent has criminal background check results that are still in  
27 question and are being resolved today.
- 28 • 20 are eligible for reunification but cannot be reunified by July 10 due  
to legitimate logistical impediments that render timely compliance  
impossible or excusable.  
○ 12 of those parents were removed from the United States. The  
Government will work with Plaintiffs' counsel to contact these  
12 parents and determine whether they wish to have their child  
reunified with them in their home country. The parties'

1 proposals regarding the process to be followed for these  
2 individuals are laid out below.

- 3 ○ 8 parents were previously released into the United States and  
4 are undergoing safety and suitability screening in accordance  
5 with the TVPRA.

6 Defendants contend that the above numbers show that Defendants are in  
7 compliance with the Court's order. Of the 75 children eligible for reunification,  
8 Defendants have already reunified 4, and expect to reunify 34 by the July 10  
9 deadline, and 16 soon thereafter pending confirmation of eligibility. Of the  
10 remaining 20, 8 will be reunified as soon as HHS can determine that the parent is  
11 not unfit or a danger to the child in accordance with its existing procedures under  
12 the TVPRA, and the remaining 12 may be reunified if their parents can be located  
13 and if those parents request reunification, and reunification is otherwise proper  
14 under the Court's order. Moreover, of the 27 children not currently eligible for  
15 reunification, 14 have parents who are not class members, and the remaining 13  
16 may be reunified if and when their parents no longer present a danger, have a  
17 communicable disease, or are in criminal custody so long as ICE is aware of their  
18 release, and it is otherwise determined that they meet the criteria for reunification.  
19 Thus, any children not being reunified by the July 10 deadline are not being  
20 reunified because of legitimate logistical impediments that render timely  
21 compliance impossible or excusable, and so Defendants are complying with the  
22 Court's order.  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**B. Plaintiffs' Position**

Plaintiffs do not agree that Defendants have fully complied with the initial reunification deadlines in the Court's preliminary injunction order. Plaintiffs received Defendants' updated numbers within the past hour, and have no independent verification that these numbers are accurate, or that there are not additional children under five who should be on the government's list. Plaintiffs, however, can state the following: By today's deadline, Defendants only plan to reunify about half of the parents with children under five years old. Plaintiffs recognize that Defendants cannot yet reunify the parents who are currently being held in criminal custody. But as to all other Class Members with children under five, the government is not in compliance with the clear deadline ordered by the Court.

1. For the Class Members who were deported without their children, Defendants have not even tried to contact them or facilitate their reunification by today. Their children are stranded in this country because of Defendants' actions, and yet Defendants have apparently done nothing to facilitate their reunification.

2. For the Class Members who have been released from custody, Defendants have not explained why they could not facilitate their reunification by the deadline. Defendants have all of these parents' contact information, and there are apparently only 8 of them. To the extent Defendants have chosen to subject

1 these parents to ORR's lengthy sponsorship process, Plaintiffs do not believe those  
 2 procedures are required. Moreover, even if Defendants believed those procedures  
 3 would prevent them from reunifying 8 parents in two weeks, they should have  
 4 informed the Court far earlier than last Friday's status conference, a mere four days  
 5 before the deadline.  
 6

7  
 8 3. There are Class Members that Defendants do not currently plan to  
 9 release today, because Defendants have not yet completed their DNA tests.  
 10 Defendants have not explained why they could not complete these tests or verify  
 11 parentage through other means by today's deadline.  
 12

13 4. There is one child for whom Defendants have not even identified a  
 14 parent. They have not explained what steps they have taken to find this Class  
 15 Member.  
 16

## 17 II. DEADLINES

- 18 • **Removed Parents:** Defendants have provided to Plaintiffs the date of  
 19 removal and country of removal for all known removed parents with  
 20 children under 5. Defendants will provide to Plaintiffs the location of  
 21 the ICE detention facility where each removed parent was last held.  
 22 Plaintiffs' counsel will seek to locate those removed parents and  
 23 provide them with notice of their right to be reunified. If any parent  
 expresses that he or she wishes to be reunified with his or her child  
 then Defendants will facilitate that reunification.

- 24 ○ Plaintiffs' Position: Plaintiffs believe that once Defendants are  
 25 notified that a removed parent wishes to be reunified with his or  
 26 her child, reunification should occur within 7 days.  
 27  
 28

○ Defendants' Position: Defendants ask the Court to allow a more flexible time period because there are several issues that may impact the timing of removal for these children. For example, Defendants would need to obtain travel documents for the child, and any ongoing removal proceedings for that child would have to be terminated which might require separate waiver from the parents and/or approval from an immigration judge. Moreover, if the child has already obtained relief and is in lawful status, then Defendants would not have the ability to facilitate reunification with a parent abroad. Because pieces of this process are out of Defendants hands, Defendants request that the Court allow for a flexible schedule for such removals that considers the need to complete these steps prior to removal for reunification.

- **Reunification To Released Parents:** This issue will be determined, at least in part, by the Court's ruling on the parties' joint submission on the procedures to be followed by HHS under the Court's order. Accordingly, the parties will meet and confer following that ruling and will submit a proposal, or respective positions, on this issue for the Court's consideration.

DATED: July 10, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lee Gelernt

Lee Gelernt\*

Judy Rabinovitz\*

Anand Balakrishnan\*

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
FOUNDATION

125 Broad St., 18th Floor

New York, NY 10004

T: (212) 549-2660

F: (212) 549-2654

*lgelernt@aclu.org*

*jrabinovitz@aclu.org*

*abalakrishnan@aclu.org*



1 Bardis Vakili (SBN 247783)  
2 ACLU FOUNDATION OF SAN DIEGO  
3 & IMPERIAL COUNTIES  
4 P.O. Box 87131  
5 San Diego, CA 92138-7131  
6 T: (619) 398-4485  
7 F: (619) 232-0036  
8 *bvakili@aclusandiego.org*

9 Stephen B. Kang (SBN 292280)  
10 Spencer E. Amdur (SBN 320069)  
11 AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
12 FOUNDATION  
13 39 Drumm Street  
14 San Francisco, CA 94111  
15 T: (415) 343-1198  
16 F: (415) 395-0950  
17 *skang@aclu.org*  
18 *samdur@aclu.org*

19 *Attorneys for Petitioners-Plaintiffs*  
20 *\*Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

21 CHAD A. READLER  
22 Acting Assistant Attorney General  
23 SCOTT G. STEWART  
24 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
25 WILLIAM C. PEACHEY  
26 Director  
27 WILLIAM C. SILVIS  
28 Assistant Director

/s/ Sarah B. Fabian  
SARAH B. FABIAN  
Senior Litigation Counsel  
NICOLE MURLEY  
Trial Attorney  
Office of Immigration Litigation  
Civil Division

1 U.S. Department of Justice  
2 P.O. Box 868, Ben Franklin Station  
3 Washington, DC 20044  
4 (202) 532-4824  
5 (202) 616-8962 (facsimile)  
6 sarah.b.fabian@usdoj.gov

7 ADAM L. BRAVERMAN  
8 United States Attorney  
9 SAMUEL W. BETTWY  
10 Assistant U.S. Attorney

11 *Attorneys for Respondents-Defendants*  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28